

Tax and the Digital Economy
Challenges and Proposals for Reform

Edited by

Werner Haslehner
Georg Kofler
Katerina Pantazatou
Alexander Rust



Published by:

Kluwer Law International B.V.
PO Box 316
2400 AH Alphen aan den Rijn
The Netherlands
E-mail: international-sales@wolterskluwer.com
Website: lrus.wolterskluwer.com

Sold and distributed in North, Central and South America by:

Wolters Kluwer Legal & Regulatory U.S.
7201 McKinney Circle
Frederick, MD 21704
United States of America
Email: customer.service@wolterskluwer.com

Sold and distributed in all other countries by:

Air Business Subscriptions
Rockwood House
Haywards Heath
West Sussex
RH16 3DH
United Kingdom
Email: international-customerservice@wolterskluwer.com

Printed on acid-free paper.

ISBN 978-94-035-0361-5

e-Book: ISBN 978-94-035-0335-6
web-PDF: ISBN 978-94-035-0350-9

© 2019 Werner Haslehner

All rights reserved. No part of this publication may be reproduced, stored in a retrieval system, or transmitted in any form or by any means, electronic, mechanical, photocopying, recording, or otherwise, without written permission from the publisher.

Permission to use this content must be obtained from the copyright owner. More information can be found at: lrus.wolterskluwer.com/policies/permissions-reprints-and-licensing

Printed in the United Kingdom.

Editors

Werner Haslehner is Professor of Law in the Faculty of Law, Economics and Finance at the University of Luxembourg, Luxembourg, where he holds the ATOZ Chair for European and International Taxation, and Director of its LLM Programme in European Union (EU) and International Tax Law. He joined the Faculty as Associate Professor in 2013, previously holding full-time academic positions in Austria at JKU Linz and in the United Kingdom at the London School of Economics and Political Sciences (LSE) and was appointed Full Professor in 2015. His research interests cover all aspects of international taxation, including the impact of EU law and tax policy.

Georg Kofler is Professor of Law and Head of the Institute for Fiscal Law, Tax Law and Tax Policy at Johannes Kepler University of Linz Law School, Austria. He previously worked with the International Department of the Austrian Federal Ministry of Finance, as acting assistant professor at New York University and as assistant professor at the University of Linz. Being an active member of several professional organizations, he serves as the chairman of the European Court of Justice Task Force of the CFE Tax Advisers Europe. His research focuses on international and European direct tax law and all aspects of Austrian tax law.

Katerina Pantazatou is an Associate Professor of Tax Law at the University of Luxembourg, Luxembourg, since September 2016. Previously, she was an FNR post-doctoral researcher at the University of Luxembourg. She received her PhD from the European University Institute (EUI), and she has been a visiting researcher at Harvard Law School and at the Institute for Austrian and International Tax law (WU) as an Ernst Mach scholar. Her research focuses on EU tax law, the digital economy and corporate governance.

Alexander Rust is Professor of Tax Law at the Institute for Austrian and International Tax Law of WU (Vienna University of Economics and Business). He previously worked as Professor of Tax Law and Director of the Master Programme in European and International Tax Law at the University of Luxembourg, as Acting Assistant Professor at New York University, and as Assistant at the University of Munich. He is a member

Editors

of the editorial board of *Intertax* and *Internationale Steuer-Rundschau*, as well as Co-Editor of the Commentary *Klaus Vogel on Double Taxation Conventions*. His main research interests are tax treaty law, EU tax law, and tax policy.

Contributors

Andrés Báez Moreno is Associate Professor of Tax Law at the Universidad Carlos III de Madrid, Spain, and a lawyer at the Madrid Bar. He has been a visiting pre- and postdoctoral researcher at the University of Münster, Germany, the University of Cologne, Germany, the University of Padua at IBFD, Italy, and the Max Planck Institute for Tax Law and Public Finance in Munich. His areas of expertise are domestic company taxation (in particular, commercial and tax accounting) and international taxation, fields in which he has published two books and more than forty articles and contributions.

Gianluigi Bizioli is Professor of Tax Law, and International and EU Tax Law at the University of Bergamo (Department of Law), Italy. He also teaches Tax Law at the *Accademia della Guardia di Finanza* in Bergamo. He earned three degrees: (1) from the University of Bergamo in Economics and Business Administration; (2) from the University of Padua in Law; and (3) a PhD in International and Comparative Tax Law from the University of Genoa. His areas of main interests are constitutional, European and International Tax Law. He is also a member of the Board of Professors of the PhD programme in *Business and Law* of the University of Bergamo, of the Direction Committee of the *Rivista di Diritto Finanziario e Scienza delle Finanze*, of *Diritto e Processo Tributario*, and of the Editorial Board of many Italian tax law reviews, as well as the Italian Member of the Academic Committee of the European Association of Tax Law Professors (EATLP) and of the International Fiscal Association (IFA). Since June 2018, he is a Counsel of the Ministry for Regional Affairs for the implementation of the asymmetric fiscal federalism in Italy, and since 2019 a Counsel of the Italian Practice of PwC Tax and Legal Services in Milan.

Peter Bräumann is an Assistant Professor for Tax Management at Johannes Kepler University, Linz, Austria and a member of the Linz Institute of Technology's (LIT) Digital Transformation and Law Lab. His research currently focuses on fundamental legal, fiscal and social challenges for domestic and international tax law caused by the ongoing digitization of both the economy and public administration.

Contributors

Yariv Brauner is the Hugh Culverhouse Eminent Scholar Chair in Taxation at the University of Florida, Levin College of Law. He joined the Florida faculty in 2006, after teaching at New York University, Northwestern, and Arizona State University. He has been a visiting professor or a guest speaker in various universities in the U.S. and abroad. He is an author of articles published in professional journals and law reviews and a co-author of *U.S. International Taxation – Cases and Materials* (with Reuven S. Avi-Yonah and Diane M. Ring), now in its 3rd. ed. He taught multiple courses in the fields of taxation, corporate taxation, international taxation, international trade law, and the law of multinational.

Tina Ehrke-Rabel is Professor of Law and since 2010 Head of the Institute for Finance and Tax Law at Karl-Franzens University, Graz. Her main areas of research interest are international, European and Austrian business tax law, including VAT and excise taxes, with a specific focus on aspects of tax enforcement and fundamental rights. She currently concentrates on the challenges of digitalization and globalization.

Joachim Englisch holds a chair for tax law and public law at Münster University, Germany. Since 2011, he is the managing director of the Institute for Tax Law at this university. At the time this book was published, he also held the Alfred-Grosser-Chair 2018/2019 at Sciences Po Paris where he carried out research on tax implications of digitalization. His main research activities are devoted to International and European tax law covering both direct and indirect taxation, and he has published and lectured extensively on a broad range of related topics. He has been invited to be a visiting professor for LLM courses on international and European tax law at several European universities.

Johannes Kofler is University Assistant at the Institute for Machine Learning at JKU since 2018. He studied Technical Physics at the Johannes Kepler University (JKU) Linz, where he graduated in 2004. He received his PhD in Theoretical Quantum Mechanics from the University of Vienna in 2009. He worked as Postdoctoral Research Scientist at the Institute for Quantum Optics and Quantum Information of the Austrian Academy of Sciences in Vienna (2009–2011) and the Max Planck Institute of Quantum Optics in Garching near Munich (2011–2017). In 2017/18, he was Researcher at AKKT, a taxation research company and cooperation partner of JKU.

Juliane Kokott holds the position of Advocate General at the Court of Justice of the European Union. Since October 2003, she has been responsible for about 1,100 cases and has delivered more than 500 opinions including about 200 on taxation. The latter covered all areas of EU Tax law, in particular the value-added tax (VAT) law and the application of the fundamental freedoms as well as the diverse EU Directives (e.g., Parent-Subsidiary Directive, Interests and Royalties Directive, and the Anti-Tax Avoidance Directive) in the field of direct taxes. Before joining the Court she was a professor at the universities of Augsburg, Heidelberg, Düsseldorf, and St. Gallen. She has also been a visiting professor at Berkeley Law, and was Deputy Chairman of the German Advisory Council on Global Change (WBGU) (1996–2003), an independent, scientific

advisory body to the German government that was established 1992 in the run-up to the Rio Earth Summit. She is a graduate of the universities of Bonn, American University/Washington D.C., Heidelberg, and Harvard Law School. She has authored and co-authored a broad variety of publications on European Law, Public International Law and European Tax law, most recently 'Das Steuerrecht der Europäischen Union'. She is currently co-presiding (with Pasquale Pistone) an ILA Study Group on International Tax Law.

Marie Lamensch is Research Professor of International and European Tax Law at the Institute for European Studies and the Law Faculty of the Vrije Universiteit Brussel. She is also visiting professor at the Université Catholique de Louvain, Belgium and the Katholieke Universiteit Leuven, Belgium and a legal adviser on tax cassation cases for a Belgian law firm. Her main research topics include VAT and European Taxation. Thanks to her specific expertise in the area of VAT, she gives training for the European Commission and the European Parliament and has become a member of relevant expert groups of the OECD, the World Customs Organisation and the EU Commission. She also gives training at the IBFD's International Tax Academy and works as Technical Editor of the International VAT Monitor. She previously acted as researcher for the G20 task force on the Financial Transactions Tax, practiced as a lawyer in Brussels and Luxembourg and worked as teaching assistant in contract law at the Université Libre de Bruxelles, Belgium. Marie holds a Law degree from the Université Libre de Bruxelles and an LLM degree in international and European Law from the Vrije Universiteit Brussel, Belgium. She obtained her Doctorate at the Vrije Universiteit Brussel in July 2014, and her PhD dissertation was awarded the 2015 Maurice Lauré Prize (IFA).

Eric Robert is a tax policy advisor at the Organisation for Economic Co-operation and Development since 2014. During that period, his work has primarily focused on the direct tax challenges posed by digitalization, notably by contributing to the '2015 OECD BEPS Action 1 Report' and the 2018 OECD Interim Report on the 'Tax Challenges Arising from Digitalisation'. Before joining the OECD, he worked as a tax advisor in the corporate tax department of Taj (French law firm member of Deloitte Touche Tohmatsu Limited), where he essentially assisted French and foreign group of companies in structuring their cross-border activities, with a focus on international tax issues. He first obtained a university degree in Law in 2005 at the University Panthéon-Assas of Paris and holds since 2011 a PhD in Public Law from the same university.

Julia Sinnig is research assistant and PhD candidate under the supervision of Professor Dr Werner Haslehner at the University of Luxembourg. Her research focuses on the taxation of the digitalized economy and more specifically on destination-based corporate taxation as a potential solution to face the challenges of the digitalized economy. She published in English, French and German language on international, European and domestic Luxembourg tax-related topics.

Contributors

Michael Tumpel is professor of business administration at Johannes Kepler University, Linz, Austria. His research emphasizes on Austrian, European and International tax law and tax management.

Viktoria Wöhrer, LL.M, BSc, is a senior associate at Rödl & Partner in Vienna and a lecturer at the Vienna University of Economics and Business (WU) as well as the author of various publications on international, European, and domestic Austrian tax law. Her doctoral thesis on 'Data Protection and Taxpayers Rights: Challenges Created by Automatic Exchange of Information' was published by IBFD and awarded the Wolfgang Gassner Science Prize, with the prize of the Austrian Bankers' Association and with the Stephan Koren Prize.

Summary of Contents

Editors	v
Contributors	vii
Preface and Acknowledgements	xxiii
CHAPTER 1	
The 2018 OECD Interim Report	
<i>Eric Robert</i>	1
CHAPTER 2	
The ‘Genuine Link’ Requirement for Source Taxation in Public International Law	
<i>Juliane Kokott</i>	9
CHAPTER 3	
EU and WTO Law Limits on Digital Business Taxation	
<i>Werner Haslehner</i>	25
CHAPTER 4	
Fairness of the Taxation of the Digital Economy	
<i>Gianluigi Bizioli</i>	49
CHAPTER 5	
Tax Policy for the Digitalized Economy under Benjamin Franklin’s Rule for Decision-Making	
<i>Andrés Báez Moreno & Yariv Brauner</i>	67
CHAPTER 6	
Equalization Taxes and the EU’s ‘Digital Services Tax’	
<i>Georg Kofler & Julia Sinnig</i>	101

Summary of Contents

CHAPTER 7		
Digital Permanent Establishments on Its Way to Becoming a Reality? The EU Commission's Proposal on Taxing 'Significant Digital Presence'		
<i>Peter Bräumann</i>		147
CHAPTER 8		
Tax Treatment of Digital Currencies		
<i>Michael Tumpel & Johannes Kofler</i>		177
CHAPTER 9		
Taxing Remote Digital Supplies		
<i>Marie Lamensch</i>		189
CHAPTER 10		
The Taxation of the Sharing Economy		
<i>Katerina Pantazatou</i>		215
CHAPTER 11		
Effective Taxation Versus Effective Data Protection?		
<i>Viktoria Wöhrer</i>		237
CHAPTER 12		
Digitalization and the Future of National Tax Systems: Taxing Robots?		
<i>Joachim Englisch</i>		261
CHAPTER 13		
Big Data in Tax Collection and Enforcement		
<i>Tina Ehrke-Rabel</i>		283
Index		335